

GIFTED EDUCATION WITHIN THE CONTEXT OF COMPARATIVE & INTERNATIONAL EDUCATION

Kathleen Stone, Ph.D.

Comparative & International Education Society

CIES Annual Conference – March 2006

Honolulu, Hawaii

VARIANCES IN THE CONSTRUCT OF GIFTEDNESS

Gifted Education is viewed as an integral part of education in the United States. Yet there are variances in terms of the construct of giftedness and the perceived need for education of the gifted in other countries of the world. In the field of Comparative & International Education, there is little reference to the education of gifted students, however countries that do not promote formal gifted education still provide educational opportunities for highly able and advanced students.

TIMSS

(Third International Math and Science Study, 1997)

- Low performance of American students compared with students from other countries.
- Particularly at 12th grade level.
- U.S. Gifted students enrolled in advanced calculus and physics classes only able to perform at level of average students from other countries.

Range of Cultural Dichotomies



- Western Culture
- Individualistic
- Universalism
- Achievement
- Secular
- High MAS Index
- Non-Western Culture
- Collectivist
- Particularism
- Ascription
- Religious
- Low MAS Index

The Clash of Civilizations and the Remaking of World Order

Samuel Huntington
c. 1996

- Evidence that factors of culture and civilization effect the participation of countries in Gifted Education.

CIVILIZATION	Sample Country
1. Sinic	China
2. Japanese	Japan
3. Hindu	India
4. Islamic	Iran
5. Orthodox	Russia
6. Western	USA
7. Latin American	Brazil
8. African	Nigeria

CIECAP - COMPARATIVE & INTERNATIONAL EDUCATION – Introductory Course Topics

Adult Ed.	Economic	Multicultural	Reform
Assessment	Education	National	Religion
Case Study	Environment	Non-Form.Ed	Research
Childhood	Equity	Organization	Sec. Educ.
Classical	Gender	Patterns	Society
Colonialism	Globalization	Peace	Systems
Culture	Intl. Educ.	Planning	Teaching
Debates	Linguistics	Policy	Theory
Development	Literacy	Political	Trends

World Council for Gifted & Talented Children

- ❑ Biennial conferences, alternating among European, Asian and North American locations.
- ❑ On alternate years, separate conferences held:
ECHA (European Council for High Ability)
Asia (Asian-Pacific Conference on Giftedness)
- ❑ Gifted & Talented International Journal
- ❑ www.worldgifted.org
- ❑ New Headquarters: Univ. of Winnipeg, Canada
- ❑ Harry Passow Intl. Award for Leadership in Gifted Educ.

WCGTC World Gifted Conferences

(30 Years 1975 – 2005)

1975	London	1991	The Hague
1977	San Francisco	1993	Toronto
1979	Jerusalem	1995	Hong Kong
1981	Montreal	1997	Seattle
1983	Manila	1999	Istanbul
1985	Hamburg	2001	Barcelona
1987	Salt Lake City	2003	Adelaide
1989	Sydney	2005	New Orleans

WCGTC Delegates

USA	Austria	Greece	Bahrain	China
Canada	Belgium	Kazakhstan	Iran	Hong Kong
Jamaica	Denmark	Russia	Israel	Indonesia
	France	Slovenia	Kuwait	India
Argentina	Germany		Jordan	Japan
Brazil	Ireland	U. K.	Qatar	Philippines
Colombia	Netherlands	Scotland	Saudi Arabia	Singapore
Peru	Portugal	Nigeria	Turkey	South Korea
Australia	Spain	South Africa	UAE	Taiwan
New Zealand	Switzerland	Sudan		Thailand

ECHA – European Council of High Ability – Correspondents

<http://www.ECHA.ws>

<i>Australia</i>	Denmark	Ireland	Slovenia
Belgium	England	<i>Jordan</i>	Spain
<i>Brasil</i>	Finland	Netherlands	Sweden
<i>Canada</i>	France	<i>Peru</i>	Switzerland
<i>Chile</i>	Germany	Poland	ECHA Journal: High Ability Studies
Croatia	Greece	Portugal	
Czech & Slovak Rep.	Hungary	Romania	

World Analysis By Country

- Area in Sq. Miles
- Population
- Literacy %
- GDP –
Gross Domestic
Product \$
- Religion

LITERACY		Literacy	Literacy
Continent	# Nations in Sample	Below 80%	80 – 100 %
N. & Central America	15	47%	53%
S. America	12	0%	100%
Europe	37	0%	100%
Asia & Middle East	44	36%	64%
Africa	47	77%	23%
Australia/ Oceania	7	43%	57%

Key Issues in the Gifted Debate

- What is meant by *Equal Educational Rights*?
 - Universal Declaration of Human Rights
 - (United Nations 1948)
“Everyone has right to education.”
 - Equal opportunity to develop abilities.
 - Equality of Opportunity
 - Treated Differently
 - Elitist Conception Gifted
 - Excellence
- VERSUS
- Equity
 - Equal Access
 - No Segregated Grouping

What are Gifted Provisions?

Grade Acceleration	Special Schools	Enrichment Opportunities	After School Enrichment
Early Entrance	Self-Contained Classrooms	Art/Music Fine Arts	Summer Programs
Grade Skipping	Pull-out Classes	Dance/Drama Ballet	Competitions Olympiads
Acceleration in Subject(s)	Clusters in Classroom	Science/Math Science Fair	Debate Chess
Ability Grouping	Differentiation in Classroom	Sport Training & Competition	Renzulli Triad Enrichment
AP Classes	INCLUSION	Technology	Mentorship

10 Factors in Determining Levels of Gifted Participation

- View of Intelligence
- Legislation
- Special Schools
- Acceleration
- Inclusion
- Pullout Classes
- Extra-Curricular
- Competitions
- Teacher Training
- University Research
- Organizations/Conferences

South America

NATION	POLICY YEAR	SPEC SCH	ACCEL	INCLU - SION	PULL OUT CLASS	EXTRA - CURR.	COMPE TITION	TRAIN- ING	UNI RES	ORG
ARGENTINA	-	+	Low	High	Isolated Efforts	+	-	-	-	1994 Conf.
BRAZIL (Portuguese)	1971 1987 1995	+	Low	High	1993 Cancel.	+	+	+	-	1971 1998 Conf.
CHILE (Andean)	Isolat. Effort	+	Low	High	-	-	-	-	'85	'79
COLOMBIA	Can- Celled	+	Low	High	-	+	-	-	-	'87
PERU (Andean)	Law 1983	+	Low	High	+	+	+	Creat. Intell.	Cr.	'96
VENEZUELA (Andean)	Can- Celled	-	Low	High	-	-	-	-	-	-

South America

- Policy & Programs Vary
- Brazil – Most Diversity Gifted
- Peru – Leads Spanish Gifted
- Rest Spanish-Speaking except Brazil (Portuguese)
- Universal Education close to being achieved.
- Majority live under poor conditions.
- Constructivism Important
- No Gifted: Ecuador, Bolivia, Paraguay
- Multi-Cultural
- Multi-Lingual
- Norms are Difficult
- Need Norms for Special Groups
- Need Own Ident. Criteria
- Ecological Validity
- Renzulli Influence '78
- Monks Triadic Model '92
- 1999 Euro Adv. Diploma in Educ. Gifted (ECHA)

Europe

WESTERN, MID, & SOUTHERN	NORTHERN	EASTERN & BALKANS
Ideological fear of promoting elite. Mainly enact Gifted Education in inclusive setting.	Resists any attempt to single out any individual. Group is unit. More important to be similar.	High ability essential to promote development of nation's industry. Little controversy re Gifted.
European Council – 25 Euro States – 1994 Gifted Recommendation	“Special educational provisions should in no way privilege one group to detriment of others.”	Salamanca Statement Inclusive Education All educ needs can be met in reg class w/ mixed-ability.
Europe divided ideologically/culturally. Differentiation/Similarity	Vague & relatively undefined gifted construct. More Research	Avoid negative consequences of label. “Deviant” from norm.

Western Europe

NATION	POLICY YEAR	SPEC SCH	ACCEL	INCLUSION	PULL OUT CLASS	EXTRA-CURR.	COMPETITION	TRAINING	UNI RES	ORG
AUSTRIA	+	+	+	+	-	+	+	+	+	+
BELGIUM	-	+	+	+	-	+	+			+
FRANCE	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	AFPE
GERMANY	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	ECHA
ITALY	-	-	-	+	-	+	+		+	+
PORTUGAL	1990	-	+	+	-	+	+	+	+	+
SWITZERLAND	1998	+	+	+	-	+	+		+	-
SPAIN	1990	-	+	+	-	+	+	+	+	2001
NETHERLANDS	+	+	+	+	-	+	+	+	+	1991

Eastern Europe

NATION	POLICY YEAR	SPEC SCH	ACCEL	INCLUSION	PULL OUT CLASS	EXTRA-CURR.	COMPE TITION	TRAIN -ING	UNI RES	ORG
BULGARIA	1990	+	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
CROATIA	1991	-	-	+	-	+	+	+	-	+
HUNGARY	1993	+	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
POLAND	1991	-	-	+	+	+	+	+	-	+
ROMANIA	1995	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
SLOVAKIA	+	+	+	+	-	+	+	+	-	+
SLOVENIA	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	-	+
UKRAINE	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	+	+

Northern Europe

NATION	POLICY YEAR	SPEC SCH	ACCEL	INCLUSION	PULL OUT CLASS	EXTRA-CURR.	COMPE TITION	TRAIN -ING	UNI RES	ORG
SWEDEN	-	-	-	+	+	-	+	+	+	-
DENMARK	-	-	-	+	-	-	+	-	+	-
FINLAND	1993	-	+	+	-	+	+	-	+	-
NORWAY	1997	-	-	+	-	-	+	-	-	-
RUSSIA	1996	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	-
LATVIA	+	-	+	+	-	+	+	-	+	-
ENGLAND/ WALES	1995	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	NA CE	NA GC

Equality & Social Collectivism

- Law of “Jante”
- Impropriety in pride of self. No one must believe they are “special.” Value sameness.
- “Nordic Model” Political ideals merged with indigenous traditions & sentiments dating from medieval/Viking era.
- Swedes ambivalent to “stars.”
- Egalitarian ethos strongest in Norway.
- Russia avoids term “gifted.”

- **MASCULINITY INDEX**
(Hofstede, 1982)

High MAS –

(U.S. 62, Austria 75 Japan 87)
Independence, Achievement,
promote individual excellence.

Low MAS -

(Sweden 6, Norway 10, Denmark 22)
Inter-dependence ideal, service, not
promote or reward some to excel.

Recent Scandinavian national
curriculum approaching notion of
Gardner’s Multiple Intelligences.

Way to bypass egalitarian dilemma &
cater to highly able in inclusive class.

MIDDLE EAST

NATION	POLICY YEAR	SPEC SCH	ACCEL	INCLU - SION	PULL OUT CLASS	EXTR A-CURR.	COMPE TITION	TRAIN -ING	UNI RES	ORG
ISRAEL	1973 1996	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	World '79
BAHRAIN	-	-	-	+	+	+	+	+	-	Arab Conf
EGYPT	-	-	+	+	+	+	+	-	-	Arab Conf
JORDAN	1987	-	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	Arab Conf
LEBANON	-	-	+	+	+	+	+	-	-	Arab Conf
MOROCCO	-	-	+	+	+	+	+	-	-	Arab Conf
TURKEY	-	-		+	+	+	+	+	-	World '99
SAUDI ARABIA	-	-		+	+	+	+	-	-	Arab Conf
UNITED ARAB EM.	-	-		+	+	+	+	-	-	Arab Conf

Asia

NATION	POLICY YEAR	SPEC SCH	ACCEL	INCLUSION	PULL OUT CLASS	EXTRA-CURR.	COMPE TITION	TRAIN-ING	UNI RES	ORG
CHINA (PRC)	1978	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	Hong Kong
INDIA	1986	-	-	+	-	-	-	-	-	+
INDONESIA	1998	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
JAPAN	-	-	-	+	-	+	+	-	-	-
KOREA	1999	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
PHILIPPINES	1987	+	-	+	-	-	-	-	+	Conf. 1983
SINGAPORE	1997	-	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
TAIWAN	1997	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+
THAILAND	1999	-	-	+	-	-	+	+	+	+

Asia

- Emphasis on Teaching According to Individual Differences.
- Social Tendency to Value Intellectuals & the wise.
- Need for Economic Development.
- Emphasis on Children's Education by Parents.
- Considerable human power planning by government.
- Identification: Multi-criteria & alternatives other than standardized intelligence tests.
- Less strict/more flexible.
- Develop talents for all.
- Most Vigorous Gifted: Taiwan, Korea, Singapore
- 1992 Asian Survey
- *Distinct curriculum for gifted has made its appearance on the Asian scene. (Roldan 1992)*

Africa

NATION	POLICY YEAR	SPEC SCH	ACCEL	INCLU - SION	PULL OUT CLASS	EXTR A-CURR.	COMPE TITION	TRAIN -ING	UNI RES	ORG
Botswana	-	+	-	+	-	-	-	-	-	-
Kenya	1991 Conf	-	-	+	-	-	-	-	-	-
Nigeria	1981 Natl Pol	-	-	+	-	-	-	-	-	-
Tanzania	-	-	-	+	-	-	-	-	-	-
South Africa	1994 New Gov.	+	+	+	+	+	+	-	1940	-

Africa

- Outside South Africa, hardly any Gifted Educ.
- Human Development Needs
- 1990's Political Unrest
- Home/School Environment
- Nutrition, Health
- African Languages
- Musical Ability
- Manual/Perceptual Skills
- Valued: quick wit, wisdom, humour, active, dynamic disposition, leadership, linguistic excellence
- Culture of Black Africans
- African Socialism – make sense of traditional African way of life in modern world.
- Perception of African Society idea of “UJAMAA”
- Extended Family
- Togetherness, Communal
- Collective Responsibility
- *My humanity bound to your humanity.*

Australia and New Zealand

NATION	POLICY YEAR	SPE C SCH	ACCEL	INCLU - SION	PULL OUT CLASS	EXTR A- CURR.	COMPE TITION	TRAIN- ING	UNI RES	ORG Conf
AUSTRALIA	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	1989 2003
NEW ZEALAND	1989 Equity	-	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+

- Practice of *streaming* (grouping) seen as elitist.
- Intelligence Testing Criticized – Multiple Int.
- Equity Objectives
- Range of SES, Culture
- Social Justice – Real Issue
- Developed Ability v/s Innate Ability
- *Tall Poppy Syndrome*

Cross-Cultural Research

Roeper Review

Special International Issue

January 2000 Milgram, Guest Ed.

- ❖ *To the best of my knowledge, very little cross-cultural research has been conducted in the field of giftedness.*
- ❖ *Cross-cultural research that identify similarities and differences, and positive and negative aspects of different approaches would be of benefit to all concerned.*
- ❖ Heller (1996) – Extensive content analysis –
Cross-cultural studies continue to play a limited role in the field of giftedness and gifted education.
- ❖ Cross-Cultural research in any domain of education is very limited.

A Cross-Cultural Comparison of the Perceived Traits of Gifted Behavior

By Kathleen Stone, Ph.D. 2000

COLLABORATION WITH 22 UNIVERSITIES

1,965 Survey Respondents

	High Participation Gifted Educ.	Medium Participation Gifted Educ.	Low Participation Gifted Educ.
WESTERN CULTURE	U.S.A. Germany	United Kingdom Spain	France Italy
NON-WESTERN CULTURE	Taiwan	Korea	Japan Thailand

Cross-Cultural Perceived Traits of Gifted Behavior

10 Country Grand Mean (Out of 5.0)

■ Reasoning	4.20	■ Insight	4.08
■ Learning	4.21	■ High IQ	4.03
■ Problem	4.19	■ Interest	4.02
■ Solving		■ Theoretical	3.90
■ Memory	4.18	■ Creativity	3.89
■ Inquiry	4.17		

Most Highly Rated Cross-Cultural Terms for Gifted Across 10 Countries

High IQ	8 Countries
Gifted	7 Countries
High Intelligence	5 Countries
Exceptional Ability, Genius	3 Countries
Intelligent, Child Prodigy	2 Countries

Gifted Education Across Cultures

- ❖ There are variances across cultures in the *terms* used to describe the gifted.
- ❖ There are variances across cultures in the *perceived traits* of gifted behavior.
- ❖ *Perceived traits* of gifted do not vary across cultures according to high, medium, and low levels of participation in gifted education.
- ❖ *Provisions* for gifted do vary.

Theory of CULTURAL INTEGRITY

- ❖ Disparities in Gifted Education may be attributed to cultural relativity.
- ❖ Broaden the rationale to an expanded theory of *Cultural Integrity*.
- ❖ Honor the strength of the culture's indigenous support for its advanced students.
- ❖ Avoid competitiveness that often evolves from global publicity regarding international achievement.
- ❖ Integrity – wholeness, completeness, soundness.
- ❖ Totality including moral sense.
- ❖ People remain committed to their indigenous cultures.
- ❖ Integrity of a culture is often challenged by Modernization & Westernization.
- ❖ Later stages of Modernization lead to de-Westernization and Resurgence of Integrity of indigenous culture.
- ❖ Honor the inherent integrity of other cultures.

I.N.S.T.E.A.D., International
*International Network Supporting
Transnational Exchange & Diversity*

Kathleen M. Stone, Ph.D.

Director of Gifted Education

La Grange School District 105

1001 South Spring Avenue

La Grange, Illinois 60525 USA

Tel. 708-482-2720 FAX 708-482-2724

E-mail: KStoneGift@aol.com

School: kstone@d105.net